

Smythesdale Estate Precinct Statement of Significance, November 2022

Heritage Place:	Smythesdale Estate Precinct	PS ref no:	HO953
------------------------	-----------------------------	-------------------	-------



What is significant?

Smythesdale Estate Precinct at Hawthorn East includes 8-18 Carlyle Street (even only) and 81-89 Harcourt Street (odd only). The original fabric dating to the Victorian and early 20th century (Federation/Early Interwar) periods is significant.

This is an incorporated document in the Boroondara Planning Scheme pursuant to Section 6(2)(j) of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987*.

Boroondara Planning Scheme

The significant elements are the original single storey houses, generally with an asymmetric façade and including the following elements:

- Hip roof, three with a gable end to the front, many retaining slate cladding
- Chimneys, mostly rendered
- Timber-framed houses - generally with ashlar boards to the façade
- Masonry houses – two face brick and two rendered
- Cornices with brackets and usually panelling
- Verandahs with cast iron frieze, some with cast iron columns, and corrugated sheet metal cladding
- Original timber-framed openings, including panelled doors (usually with sidelights) and double-hung sash windows
- Federation period additions to 18 Carlyle Street and early 20th century (Late Federation/Early Interwar) garage to 83 Harcourt Street
- Basalt kerbing and channelling to Harcourt Street.

Rear additions and all front fences are not significant.

How is it significant?

Smythesdale Estate Precinct is of local historical and representative significance and partly of aesthetic significance (relating to 89 Harcourt Street) to the City of Boroondara.

Why is it significant?

Smythesdale Estate Precinct is of historical significance for reflecting the late Victorian period suburban building in the area that followed the extension of the railway to Camberwell station. This extension was the impetus for opening up parts of Hawthorn East that had hitherto been relatively isolated and began to realise their residential development potential at the end of Melbourne's famed 'boom period'. This marked a shift from the earlier market gardening, etc. use of the area (when it was part of John Robert Murphy's 124-acre Crown Allotment 70, known as the Village of Rathmines subdivision). Whilst the building stock is varied, it generally represents the mid to upper end of the villa spectrum, especially 89 Harcourt Street, and so reflects the prestige of the area as a 'gentleman's retreat', established about in the vicinity from about 1870. The precinct area derives from the substantial holdings of the nearby residence *Ultima* (1099 Burke Road), when it was owned by entrepreneur/impresario Robert Sparrow Smythe who was a prominent citizen and lived in the area for some time. The name of the estate and Carlyle Street relate to his family. (Criterion A)

This is an incorporated document in the Boroondara Planning Scheme pursuant to Section 6(2)(j) of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987*.

Boroondara Planning Scheme

Smythesdale Estate Precinct is of representative significance as a small, cohesive group of late Victorian housing. They are generally comfortable suburban villas dating to the final phase of 19th century development before a long economic depression. They were all erected during a five-year period (1887 to 1892), though two have additions dating to the early 20th century, which are also significant being those to the north and south end of 18 Carlyle Street (Federation period) and the red brick garage at 83 Harcourt Street (late Federation/early Interwar period). Compared to many other such groups in the Hawthorn area, the precinct is distinguished by the preponderance of asymmetric facades and a few gable ends, when there was a clear preference in other parts or slightly earlier estates for symmetrical façade composition with a fully hipped roof. As such, this group of houses is indicative of a purer Italianate style ethos, informed by the English Picturesque Movement and suggestive of a vernacular Italian origin. The level of intactness is generally high with a mix of brick and timber-framed buildings (some of the latter with brick party walls), several retaining slate roof cladding, and usually having classical mouldings and other elements, as well as original cast iron detailing to the verandahs. (Criterion D)

Tempe at 89 Harcourt Street is of aesthetic significance as an intact and commodious, late Italianate style villa (likely architect designed) of rendered brick distinguished by an array of cast iron detailing - crestings, to the gablet, frieze and paired columns to the return verandah. Other notable elements include a cornice with fluted console brackets, near full length windows to the front, and entry with glazed and panelled door. Original elements also include slate roof cladding, chimneys, tessellated tiling to the verandah, and basalt stair. (Criterion E)

Primary source

Smythesdale Estate Precinct Heritage Citation (RBA, November 2022).

Grading table

Name	Number	Street	Built Date	Grading
House	8	Carlyle Street	1887	Contributory
House	10	Carlyle Street	1892	Contributory
House	12	Carlyle Street	1892	Contributory
House	14	Carlyle Street	1892	Contributory
House	16	Carlyle Street	1892	Contributory
House	18	Carlyle Street	1890	Contributory

This is an incorporated document in the Boroondara Planning Scheme pursuant to Section 6(2)(j) of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987*.

Boroondara Planning Scheme

Name	Number	Street	Built Date	Grading
<i>Lara</i>	81	Harcourt Street	By 1889	Contributory
<i>House</i>	83	Harcourt Street	By 1889	Contributory
<i>House</i>	85	Harcourt Street	By 1889	Contributory
<i>House</i>	85A	Harcourt Street	Early 1960s	Non-contributory
<i>House</i>	87	Harcourt Street	By 1889	Contributory
<i>Tempe</i>	89	Harcourt Street	By 1887	Significant

This is an incorporated document in the Boroondara Planning Scheme pursuant to Section 6(2)(j) of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987*.